

PT8 - Tender Award Report

This document is used to summarise the procurement process



Report Title	Barbican Estate Redecoration Programme 2020-25 tender Award
Report Author	Christina Paraskevaidou
Report Date	10/02/2020
Procurement Reference	prj_COL_15285

Key Area	Outcome
Purpose of Report	Authorisation to award tender
Tender Process	Open sub-OJEU Tender
Proposed Provider	K&M McLoughlin Decorating Ltd
Cost (ex. VAT)	£3,726,649.70 BAFO 3,652,116.72
Potential Risks	No risks identified at this stage

Detailed Summary

1. Summary

Details of what needs to be approved and a list of key areas covered by the report

Approve the award to K&M McLoughlin Decorating Ltd, who was the supplier with the highest score after the evaluation of the tender.

2. Recommendations

Details of who the contract is to be awarded to, proposed contract term, extensions and other relevant details

Contract to be awarded to K&M McLoughlin Decorating Ltd
Contract duration April 2020-March 2025

3. Current Service Provision

Details of current supplier, contract arrangements, expiry dates and potential exit issues.

Not applicable

4. Evaluation Summary

Overview of the tender process including SQ and ITT outcomes; evaluation criteria and weighting, evaluation outcomes including overview of the top 3 ranked suppliers.

Criteria Weighting (%)

Technical Score Weight 60%

Commercial Score Weight 40%

Tender Questions

Question Number	Question	Word Count	Weighting
1	Staff Structure & Resources Please explain your proposed staffing structure for the service.	750	10%

	<p>Your response should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Roles and responsibilities • Availability of on & of site resources • Qualifications / experience of management <p>Locality of existing staff</p>			
2	<p>Case Studies</p> <p>The Barbican is a residential Grade II listed estate. Please provide two Case Studies to demonstrate previous experience of carrying works out on such buildings – this to include actions taken to ensure works are of the highest quality along with mitigating risks of any damage to the building's fabric. Case Studies are also to include both original contract sum and final account sum with any reasons for difference in value. References are to be provided for each Case Study.</p>	750	25%	
3	<p>Customer Service & Communication</p> <p>A high quality service is an essential requirement & high standards of customer services are expected. Please evidence your approach to delivering excellent customer service on this requirement. Your response should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Customer care statement • Compliments & complaints (including dispute resolution) • Surveys & feedback 	750	10%	
4	<p>Programme & Reporting</p> <p>The supplier will provide a 24 month programme of works showing level of resources and activities to be undertaken for each stage of the project along with how this will be effectively managed, including project management methodology, actions to reduce slippage and how you will report to the City's Supervisor/Contract Administrator during the course of the contract. Your response should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Gantt chart or equivalent showing key activities of the works • Impact on residential areas, e.g. site compound requirements Standard reports & information supplied. • Ability to export data and formats (e.g. excel) • Meetings • A sample report may be submitted for illustrative purposes. However, the evaluation is to be based on the response to this question <p>The City will look for evidence that the supplier can demonstrate that they have understood the</p>	1000	10%	

	objectives of the project & will provide a fully inclusive service to ensure delivery of the requirements.			
5	<p>Site Management & Out of Hour's Procedures. Please explain how the service will be managed on both a day to day basis & out of hour's issues. Your response should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local & area management • Leadership from your organisation • Operation tasks and how these will be managed • Co-ordination & communication between sites as well as the City's project manager • Process flow diagrams • Hours of reactive service support & call out times • Personnel involved 	750	10%	
6 (a)	<p>Employment Skills and Training Menu (See attached menu) Please complete the Employment, Skills and Training Menu with your chosen combination of options. These MUST add up to a total of 100.</p> <p>This is a pass/fail question and no additional points will be given for options that add up to a higher total than 100. The quality of delivery of your chosen combination is assessed below in 6b).</p>		Pass/Fail	
6 (b)	<p>Delivery of the Employment and Skills Training Please describe your rationale and how you intend to implement your chosen combination of employment/ skills/ training options, which you have selected from the menu provided in 6a). This should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A brief summary as to why the selected combination of opportunities have been chosen (best alignment with business model/ size/ priorities, best way of filling skills gaps etc.) • how and when candidates will be recruited/ trained • which (if any) demographics/ socially excluded groups of focus have been chosen (e.g. NEETs, ex-offenders etc.) and why • The nature and level of any associated qualifications • which partner organisation(s) the bidder will work with to facilitate delivery and why • how candidates will be provided with 	750	20%	

	<p>pastoral support/ mentoring by the bidder or third party</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> any sustainable employment opportunities available to the candidates as a consequence of their work on this contract. 			
7	<p>Air quality and public health</p> <p>Please state which of the air quality options (as detailed in the specification/ scope) you choose to implement within 6 months of contract commencement: i.e. green driver training, vehicle and/or technology trials, or a suitable alternative intervention.</p>	500	Pass/Fail	
8	<p>Environmental Sustainability</p> <p>Please describe how your organisation will ensure that potential environmental impacts are minimised throughout the delivery of this contract.</p> <p>Your response should cover your approach to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> mitigating air pollution (in terms of VOCs from paint and dust suppression as well as vehicular emissions) efficient use of resources (materials, energy, water etc.) use of sustainably sourced and non-hazardous materials application of the waste hierarchy. 	500	10%	
9	<p>Innovation, Added Value and Social Responsibility.</p> <p>Please propose opportunities for innovation and added value. Your response should include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use of innovation to improve efficiency/ reduce wastage and/or minimise cost during works. Targeting supply chain opportunities towards social enterprises or SMEs <p>Any other added value not already covered in question 6 e.g. skilled volunteering to support community projects.</p>	500	5%	
10	<p>Compliance and Protection of Workers</p> <p>Please describe the procedures you will use to ensure that all employees and any workers, including sub-contractors, agency workers or any other contractors working on site:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> have a legal right to work in the UK are not bonded workers (e.g. in debt to agencies charging fees for employment or retaining passports etc.) have legitimate CSCS cards have legitimate qualifications from 	300	Pass/Fail	

	recognised training institutions		
	NB: The City of London reserves the right to undertake spot checks to verify the procedures described in the response to this question		
Total			100%

Average price: £4,730,836.69

Average price vs the winning bidder: £4,730,836.69 vs £3,726,649.70 **BAFO 3,652,116.72**

Suppliers Quinn London limited & Seville Developments Limited have submitted a joint bid and have been evaluated as one response, so the total number of responses is 13.

Moderated technical scoring for all suppliers can be found on the appendix

Timeline for the tender process: Tender was live from 24/09/2019 until 25/10/2019. Moderation meeting was held on 10/12/2019. The evaluation of the responses has been completed by mid-December 2019.

5. Savings, efficiencies and benefits

Pricing overview, including cost type (fixed cost, schedule of rates etc) and cashable and non-cashable savings achieved.

BAFO saving of 2% on the original tendered bid.

Original price: **£3,726,649.70**

BAFO: 3,652,116.72

6. Lessons Learnt

No further lessons learnt

7. Contract Management Plan

Details of persons managing the contract covering roles and responsibilities of individual staff.

David Downing

Asset Programme Manager

David.Downing@cityoflondon.gov.uk

8. Approval Sign Off

Name of Approver	Michael Harrington
Position	Senior Category Manager
Date approved	10/02/2020
Approver comments	N/A

9. Appendices Final evaluation score summary, savings certificate, etc

Weighted Scores & Supplier Ranking

Supplier	Total price	Weighted Price Score	Weighted Technical Score	Total Score	Ranking
AD Construction Group (Architectural Decorators Ltd)	£ 4,172,955.05	23.94%	26.40%	50.34%	6
Alfred Bagnall & Sons (Restoration) Ltd.	£ 2,867,593.00	34.84%	31.80%	66.64%	3
Bell Decorating Group Limited	£ 2,497,611.84	40%	20.40%	60.40%	5
Ian Williams Limited	£ 2,903,737.00	34.41%	33.60%	68.01%	2
K&M McLoughlin Decorating Ltd	£ 3,726,649.70	26.81%	52.80%	79.61%	1
Mitie Property Services (UK) Ltd	£ 3,358,084.30	29.75%	20.40%	50.15%	7
MULALLEY & CO LTD	£ 3,594,949.00	27.79%	36.60%	64.39%	4
Novus Property Solutions Ltd	£ 6,690,427.81	14.93%	21%	35.93%	12
Quinn London Limited				0.00%	8
Seville Developments Limited	£ 3,483,523.75	28.68%	21%	49.68%	8
Smith & O'Sullivan Limited	£ 4,548,279.33	21.97%	19.80%	41.77%	11
TCL Group	£ 4,973,367.23	20.09%	22.20%	42.29%	10
TSG Building Services plc	£ 15,074,863.00	6.63%	18.60%	25.23%	13
Whittle Programmed Maintenance	£ 3,608,836.00	27.68%	17.40%	45.08%	9
Average Price	£ 4,730,836.69				

Original Form of Tender



002-Signed_Form_of_Tender.pdf

Best and Final Offer



Form of Tender - COL Barbican Estate